

**Public Policy 495: 002 – Immigration Policy Seminar
Prof. Ann Chih Lin**

**Mondays and Wednesdays, 2:30-4 pm
1220 Weill**

Fifty years ago, the 1965 Hart-Celler Act changed the racial and ethnic composition of America, while creating a system of choices - both intended and unintended - that continue to shape today's authorized and unauthorized migration flows to the U.S. How we got there and where it leaves us are the questions for this class. We use this examination of immigration policy to practice two critical tools of policy professionals: how to assess the political environment in which policies are created, and how to evaluate the impact that a policy tool can or has had on a policy problem.

Goals

The study of immigration touches on deep beliefs about what our country should stand for, as well as on empirical questions for which there is conflicting social science evidence. My goals for this class are (1) that you learn to identify these beliefs and questions, and why they are relevant to immigration policy; (2) that you learn to recognize the tradeoffs implicit in different policy solutions, and acknowledge them even as you support any particular position; and (3) that you leave the class understanding the best rationale for the policy positions you do not hold, as well as the best rationale for the positions you have.

I also hope to help you accomplish your goals during this class. Please help me to do so by letting me know what they are. Prior to class: please write and submit a short essay (100-250 words; 1 double-spaced page): What interests me about immigration policy? What am I hoping to learn from this class? We will use your goals, and mine, to help with our ongoing evaluation of the course.

Writing

The major writing assignment in this class is a 20-25 page analysis of one aspect of contemporary immigration reform in the United States. Your paper will consider the political environment that proposal faces, and the extent to which it could address the problem it seeks to solve. You will receive an "Assignment Guide" with suggested topics and writing instructions.

You will write the paper in stages. First, you will work in groups to explore a political or historical question that will help you understand how to place a policy issue in its political context. Next, you'll complete a worksheet that will help to guide you through the process of researching and writing your paper. You'll present a first draft of your findings in the middle of November, and get comments from your peers and your instructor. Your final paper is due at the scheduled final exam due date/time for this class: Wednesday, December 16, at 3:30 pm.

Grading

Our class is a seminar and your participation is essential. We will have a variety of activities in the class, from online discussions to peer reviews to "show and tell", as well as both small and large group conversation in class. I hope that you will also give me suggestions about how you can learn better as the semester continues.

Your grades in the class are apportioned so as to reflect the importance of consistent, ongoing activity.

Class participation: 30%

Group presentation (October): 15%

Online worksheet for final paper (October): 15%

Individual presentations (November): 20%

Final paper (December): 20%

Class Schedule

All readings are linked on the class website. Discussion questions appear on the content page for each day.

Wednesday, September 9: **Introductions**



Friday, September 11: **Survey: "What are your immigration priorities?"**



Monday, September 14: **What Are Our Immigration Priorities?**



Due Monday, September 14, before class: Participate in your group discussion: "Why would a country choose to allow 'over quota' immigration?"

Due Monday, September 14, before class: Essay: "Immigration and Me"

Wednesday, September 16: **Comparing Sponsorship and Points Systems as Immigration Tools**

[Randall Monger and James Yankay, "U.S. Permanent Legal Residents: 2013." 2014. Office of Immigration Statistics: Policy Directorate, Department of Homeland Security. May.](#)  


["Canada: Permanent Residents by Category: Principal Applicants" and "Canada: Permanent Residents by Category: Spouses and Dependents"." Tables taken from *Facts and Figures 2013: Immigration Overview - Permanent Residents*. 2014. Research and Evaluation Branch, Citizenship and Immigration Services Canada, p. 12-13.](#)  

[Brian Ray, "Canada: Policy Changes and Integration Challenges in an Increasingly Diverse Society." 2005. *Migration Information Source*. November 1.](#)  

[Demetrios G. Papademetriou, "Selecting Economic Stream Immigrants Through Points Systems." 2007. *Migration Information Source*. May 18.](#)  

Monday, September 21: **Indentures and Migration Subsidies as Immigration Tools**

Attention: Write your "Expectations Essay" **before** you read!

[David Galenson, "The Rise and Fall of Indentured Servitude in the Americas: An Economic Analysis." *Journal of Economic History* 44\(1\):1-26. March.](#)  


[Gary Howells, "'For I Was Tired of England Sir': English Pauper Emigrant Strategies, 1834-1860." 1998. *Social History* 23\(2\):181-94. May.](#)  


Charlotte Erickson, *American Industry and the European Immigrant, 1860-1885*. 1957. Harvard University Press.


[Ch. 1, "Organized Efforts to Promote Immigration"](#)  


[Ch. 4, "Agencies in Europe for Recruiting Unskilled Industrial Labor"](#)  

Wednesday, September 23: **Race, Nationalization, Documents, and Citizenship**



[Gwendolyn Mink, "Ch. 2: Old Labor and New Immigrants: The Antagonism" and "Ch. 3: Meat vs. Rice \(and Pasta\): Discovering Labor Politics in California, 1875-85." 1986. In *Old Labor and New Immigrants in American Political Development: Union, Party, and State 1875-1920*. Cornell University Press](#)  



["Milestones: 1866-1998: Chinese Immigration and the Chinese Exclusion Acts." n.d. Office of the Historian, Bureau of Public Affairs, United States Department of State. Accessed at: !\[\]\(cbe2492b119e39e02a1dab2af4a4b296_img.jpg\) <https://history.state.gov/milestones/1866-1898/chinese-immigration> \(Links to an external site.\)](#) 



["Chew Heong v. the United States: Chinese Exclusion and the Federal Courts." n.d. Teaching and Civic Resources, History of the Federal Judiciary, Federal Judicial Center. Accessed at: \[http://www.fjc.gov/history/home.nsf/page/tu_exclusion_narrative.html\]\(http://www.fjc.gov/history/home.nsf/page/tu_exclusion_narrative.html\)](#) 

[Fred Barbash, "Donald Trump meet Wong Kim Ark, the Chinese American cook who is the father of 'birthright citizenship.'" 2015. *Washington Post*. August 31.](#)  

Monday, September 28: **Country Quotas and Illegality as Immigration Tools**



[Daniel Tichenor, "Ch. 5: Progressivism, War, and Scientific Policymaking: The Rise of the National Origins Quota System, 1900-1928." 2002. In *Dividing Lines: The Politics of Immigration Control in America*. Princeton University Press.](#)  

[Daniel Tichenor, 2002. *Dividing Lines*, p. 167-175. \(Start from "Welcoming Mexican Guestworkers: Winking at Lax Enforcement" at the bottom of p. 167; read to end of chapter.\)](#)  

[Claudia Sadowski-Smith, "Unskilled Labor Migration and the Illegality Spiral: Chinese, Mexican, and European Indocumentados in the United States, 1882-2007." 2008. *American Quarterly* 60\(3\):779-804. September.](#)  

Wednesday, September 30: **In-class appointments for group presentations**

[Daniel Tichenor, *Ch. 7, "Strangers in Cold War America: The Modern Presidency, Committee Barons, and Postwar Immigration Politics."* in !\[\]\(7d1d6890825e83a6a4a51febe2dcc7f3_img.jpg\) !\[\]\(5b78f4d8e2942ab203be44f938cc0a7c_img.jpg\) *Dividing Lines*. !\[\]\(1f09aec1483927ae51093bfc72ceaa0e_img.jpg\) !\[\]\(c702199a36cbde2949382280b60f9b03_img.jpg\)](#)

[Mae Ngai, Ch. 4, "Braceros, 'Wetbacks,' and the National Boundaries of Class.' 2004. *Impossible Subjects: Illegal Aliens and the Making of Modern America*. Princeton University Press.](#)  



Your group should also choose and have read at least TWO other academic sources or THREE primary sources (contemporary documents) related to the 1964 Hart Celler Act or the abolition of the Bracero program in 1964.

Anniversary of the Hart-Celler Act – October 3, 1965

Monday, October 5 – Group Presentations

- (1) What changed in the country between McCarran-Walter in 1952 and Hart-Celler in 1965? What best explains why Hart-Celler was such a drastic change in tone and philosophy from McCarran-Walter – or are the two laws not as different as they seem on the surface?
- (2) How did labor unions feel about the provisions of Hart-Celler? How were they able to influence it, and why? Would they have preferred different provisions? Should Hart-Celler be considered a political “success” for labor?
- (3) The failure to reauthorize the bracero program in 1964, the numerical limit on Western Hemisphere immigration, and the lack of a robust guestworker program for agricultural labor in the 1965 Hart-Celler Act all speak to changes in the ability of farmers, particularly in the West and Southwest, to influence national immigration policy. What happened to farmers' influence in this period, and why? Did they support or oppose the Hart-Celler Act, and what might they have preferred in its place?
- (4) What was the Republican position on Hart-Celler? Was the party united? What changes, if any, were made to the bill to win their support?
- (5) What coalition of Democrats was formed to pass Hart-Celler? What part of the party refused to support it? What were the arguments on each side? Was there a position that would have allowed the party to stay together? What made it possible for Democrats to ignore the part of their party that opposed Hart-Celler, and join with Republicans to pass it?
- (6) Historians have argued about whether the sponsors of Hart-Celler understood that it would be the catalysis for dramatic racial and ethnic change in the U.S. Examine the evidence for and against the proposition that leaders understood what they were doing, and take a position.


Wednesday, October 7: Low-Skilled Labor and the Hart-Celler Act

[Douglas Massey and Karen Pren, "Unintended Consequences of U.S. Immigration Policy: Explaining the Post-1965 Surge from Latin America." 2012. *Population and Development Review* 38\(1\):1-29. March.](#)  



[BBC News. "Q & A: Schengen Agreement." 2013. March 4. \(Links to an external site.\) "Free Movement: EU Nationals." European Commission: Employment, Social Affairs, and Inclusion. \(Links to an external site.\)](#)

[Argeo Paul Celluci and Stephen R. Kelly, "Taking a NAFTA Approach to Immigration." 2013. *Wall Street Journal*. March 10.](#)  

Monday, October 12: Refugees and the Hart-Celler Act


["Refugees: A Factsheet." 2014. American Immigration Council. December. Accessed at: !\[\]\(8af806fb1314382d09bc5ec5b767526c_img.jpg\) !\[\]\(e640e0608cc7d5ca49cf1ad6b9b82bbd_img.jpg\) http://www.immigrationpolicy.org/just-facts/refugees-fact-sheet \(Links to an external site.\)](http://www.immigrationpolicy.org/just-facts/refugees-fact-sheet)

["World at War: UNHCR Global Trends - Forced Displacement in 2014". 2015. UNHCR \(Publications-Statistics Catalogue\). June 19. Accessed at: !\[\]\(2e897e890e69d81eae4503a8342c36b0_img.jpg\) !\[\]\(ce4e2504c7100a62a9a9496b2e01b6e4_img.jpg\) http://www.unhcr.org/556725e69.html](http://www.unhcr.org/556725e69.html) **READ p. 1-34.**

[Markus Dettmer, Carolyn Kattschak, and Georg Ruppert. 2015. "Rx for Prosperity: German Companies See Refugees as Opportunity." Translated by Christopher Sultan. Der Spiegel, August 27. Accessed at Spiegel Online International: http://www.spiegel.de/international/germany/refugees-are-an-opportunity-for-the-german-economy-a-1050102.html](http://www.spiegel.de/international/germany/refugees-are-an-opportunity-for-the-german-economy-a-1050102.html)  

Wednesday, October 14: **What Kind of a Problem is “Illegal Immigration”?**

After you read, take the quiz, “How Do We End Illegal Immigration?: Learning to Evaluate Policy” before class.

[Jeffrey Passel, Mark Hugo Lopez, Jens Manuel Krogstad and Ana Gonzales-Barrera. "As Growth Stalls, Unauthorized Immigrant Population Becomes More Settled." 2014. Pew Hispanic Trends Research Center Report. September. Accessed at: !\[\]\(0aff635c4179ba9e710b00f4b01d3b20_img.jpg\) !\[\]\(29658d981ebdf5edc259074cbf6110e0_img.jpg\) http://www.pewhispanic.org/files/2014/09/2014-09-03_Unauthorized-Final.pdf \(Links to an external site.\)](http://www.pewhispanic.org/files/2014/09/2014-09-03_Unauthorized-Final.pdf)

[Jeffrey Passel and D'Vera Cohn. 2015. "Unauthorized Immigrant Population Stable for Half a Decade." Pew Hispanic Trends Research Center FactTank. July 22. Accessed at: \(Links to an external site.\)http://www.pewresearch.org/fact-tank/2015/07/22/unauthorized-immigrant-population-stable-for-half-a-decade/ \(Links to an external site.\) \(Links to an external site.\)](http://www.pewresearch.org/fact-tank/2015/07/22/unauthorized-immigrant-population-stable-for-half-a-decade/)



["Unauthorized Immigrant Populations by Country and Region, Top State and County Destinations 2009-2013." 2015. Migration Policy Institute. Interactive Exhibit. Accessed at: http://www.migrationpolicy.org/programs/data-hub/charts/unauthorized-immigrant-populations-country-and-region-top-state-and-county \(Links to an external site.\)](http://www.migrationpolicy.org/programs/data-hub/charts/unauthorized-immigrant-populations-country-and-region-top-state-and-county)



Friday, October 16: **“Online Worksheet: Planning the Final Paper” due**

Monday, October 19: **Fall Break – No Class**



Tuesday, October 20: **Mid-class Essay: “Are My Goals Changing?” due**



Wednesday, October 21: **Can Border Enforcement End “Entry Without Inspection (EWI)?”**



[Douglas J. Massey: "Backfire at the Border: Why Enforcement without Legalization Cannot Stop Illegal Immigration." 2005. Cato Institute Center for Trade Policy Studies No. 29. June 13.](http://www.cato.org/publications/working-paper/2005/06/backfire-at-the-border-why-enforcement-without-legalization-cannot-stop-illegal-immigration)  

[Marc Rosenblum and Doris Messner with Claire Bergeron and Faye Hipsman. 2014. "The Deportation Dilemma: Reconciling Tough and Humane Enforcement." *Migration Policy Institute*. April.](#)   READ p. 1-7 (Sections A-F), p. 19-35.



Monday, October 26: **Reducing Demand for Unauthorized Labor**



[Peter Brownell, "The Declining Enforcement of Employer Sanctions." 2005. *Migration Information Source*. September 1. Accessed at: <http://www.migrationpolicy.org/article/declining-enforcement-employer-sanctions>.](#)  



[Marc Rosenblum, "E-Verify: Strengths, Weaknesses, and Proposals for Reform." 2011. *Migration Policy Institute:MPI Insight*. February.](#)  



[Office of the Inspector General, "U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement's Worksite Enforcement Administrative Inspection Process." 2014. *Department of Homeland Security*. February.](#)  




Wednesday, October 28: **Do Undocumented Immigrants Harm Native Workers?**

[Ethan Lewis, "The Impact of Immigration on American Workers and Businesses." 2007. *Choices: A Publication of the American Agricultural Economics Association*. 22\(1\). 1st Quarter. Accessed at: <http://farmdoc.illinois.edu/policy/choices/20071/theme2/2007-1-10.pdf>.](#)  

[Steven A. Camarota and Karen Zeigler. "Immigrant Gains and Native Losses in the Job Market, 2000-2013." 2013. *Center for Immigration Studies: Backgrounder*. July.](#)  

[Amelie F. Constant, "Do Migrants Take the Jobs of Native Workers?" 2014. *IZA World of Labor* 2014\(10\):May. Accessed at: <http://wol.iza.org/articles/do-migrants-take-the-jobs-of-native-workers.pdf>.](#)  

[Blake Sisk and Carl Bankston III, "Hurricane Katrina, a Construction Boom, and a New Labor Force: Latino Immigrants and the New Orleans Construction Industry, 2000 and 2006-2010." *Population Development and Policy Review* 33\(3\):309-334.](#)  

[Mette Foged and Giovanni Peri "How Immigrants and Job Mobility Help Low-Skilled Workers." 2015. *VOXEU: Centre for Economic Policy Research Policy Portal*. April 19. Accessed at; <http://www.voxeu.org/article/how-immigrants-and-job-mobility-help-low-skilled-workers> \(Links to an external site.\)](#)   

Monday, November 2: **Promoting and Preventing Immigration**

- [Karthick Ramakrishnan and Pratheepan Gulasekaram, "Understanding Immigration Federalism in the United States." 2014. *Center for American Progress*. March. Accessed at: !\[\]\(6841ca9b0e023296428e7c9e683b9367_img.jpg\) <https://www.americanprogress.org/wp-content/uploads/2014/03/StateImmigration-reportv2.pdf> \(Links to an external site.\) !\[\]\(e258e347e7683f87061f627f84598eb5_img.jpg\)](#)
[Richard Cebula and Usha Nair-Reichert, "Access to Higher Public Education and Locational Choices of Undocumented Migrants." 2014. Working Paper: Munich RePEc Archive. July 3. Accessed at: \[https://mpira.ub.uni-muenchen.de/57277/1/MPRA_paper_57277.pdf\]\(https://mpira.ub.uni-muenchen.de/57277/1/MPRA_paper_57277.pdf\) !\[\]\(1233990ad3f0b7475c568d7bf16af31f_img.jpg\) !\[\]\(18570b67a4686b081406cd3de636c1c3_img.jpg\) READ: Sections 1, 2, and 4.](#)
- [Catalina Amuedo-Dorantes, Thitima Puttitanun, and Ana P. Martinez-Donate, "How Do Tougher Immigration Measures Affect Unauthorized Immigrants?" 2013. *Demography* 50\(3\):1067-1091. June. !\[\]\(411af059a517db12f1097bc63c4fbe36_img.jpg\) !\[\]\(ed2b7fb1e3bd6514676d2ab3c70d5776_img.jpg\)](#)
- [Magnus Lofstrom, Sarah Bohn, and Steven Raphael, "Lessons from the 2007 Legal Arizona Workers Act." 2011. *Public Policy Institute of California*. March. Accessed at: \[http://www.ppic.org/content/pubs/report/R_311MLR.pdf\]\(http://www.ppic.org/content/pubs/report/R_311MLR.pdf\) !\[\]\(63f22f364560f085b88206f094473649_img.jpg\) !\[\]\(1167d0d640d4660b041f4c30896eb62c_img.jpg\)](#)

Wednesday, November 4: **Legalization: IRCA as a Policy Model**


- [Amanda Levinson, "Why Countries Continue to Consider Regularization." 2005. *Migration Information Source*. September 1. !\[\]\(a88007b249b36c75dcbde101f514cec3_img.jpg\) !\[\]\(800628c068083563f747129d8b339031_img.jpg\)](#)
- [Susan Gonzalez Baker, "The 'Amnesty' Aftermath: Current Policy Issues Stemming from the Legalization Programs of the 1986 Immigration Reform and Control Act." 1997. *International Migration Review* 31\(1\):5-27. Spring. !\[\]\(01f5879e654468630e790d983a473ee0_img.jpg\) !\[\]\(ce8b778f402aca455ccdfd070a33a08d_img.jpg\)](#)
- [Philip Martin, "Good Intentions Gone Awry: IRCA and U.S. Agriculture." 1994. *Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science* 534: 44-57. July. !\[\]\(c4a503502fa8c84efaf3849039d81824_img.jpg\) !\[\]\(a109cdb3d611d5f1b240988e8ef9c59e_img.jpg\)](#)
- [Sherrie Koussoudji and Deborah Cobb-Clark, "Coming Out of the Shadows: Learning about Legal Status and Wages from the Legalized Population." 2002. *Journal of Labor Relations* 20\(3\):598-628 !\[\]\(d71c711e57cec5a823156542f63a9248_img.jpg\) !\[\]\(6882145ce9ee268a53810f22a2c366af_img.jpg\). READ: 598-601, 613-624.](#)

Monday, November 9 – Monday, November 23: **Individual Presentations**

Wednesday, November 25: **Thanksgiving – Class Cancelled**

Monday, November 30 – Wednesday, December 2: **How Can Asylum Decision-Making Be Improved?**

Reading:

- [General Accounting Office, "U.S. Asylum System: Significant Variation Existed in Asylum Outcomes Across Immigration Courts and Judges". 2008. GAO 08-940. September. !\[\]\(e7a5b2ecc7ab80b32b565dd7dfa9a5a9_img.jpg\) !\[\]\(51a3b3d739efe92b5a87bb7fdd8bc4bf_img.jpg\)](#)


Watch:

[Shari Robertson and Michael Camerini, "Well-Founded Fear." 2000. POV in conjunction with PBS. Premiere: June 5. Archived at: http://www.pbs.org/pov/wellfoundedfear/](http://www.pbs.org/pov/wellfoundedfear/) (Links to an external site.)

Monday, December 7 – Wednesday, December 9: **How Should Countries React to Mass Refugee Movements?**

Read:

[Anemona Hartocollis, "Reporter's Notebook: Traveling in Europe's River of Migrants." 2015. New York Times Online. Accessed at: http://www.nytimes.com/interactive/projects/cp/reporters-notebook/migrants?smid=tw-share](http://www.nytimes.com/interactive/projects/cp/reporters-notebook/migrants?smid=tw-share) (Links to an external site.)

[Anthony Faiola and Michael Birnbaum, "In Migrant Crisis, German Generosity Comes Under Fire." 2015. *Washington Post*. September 7.](http://www.washingtonpost.com/archive/local/2015/09/07/) 

[Griff Witte, "Hungarian Bishop Says Pope Is Wrong about Refugees." 2015. *Washington Post*. September 7.](http://www.washingtonpost.com/archive/local/2015/09/07/) 

Watch:

Scott Anderson (Text) and Paulo Pellegrin (Photography and Video). "Desperate Crossing". 2015. New York Times Magazine Interactive Feature. September 3. Accessed at: http://www.nytimes.com/interactive/2015/09/03/magazine/migrants.html?smid=tw-share&_r=0

Monday, December 14: **Conclusion**

Wednesday, December 16: Final Paper due at 3:30 pm